

Croydon Council

For General Release	
REPORT TO:	Councillor Alisa Flemming Cabinet Member for Children, Families & Learning
AGENDA ITEM:	
SUBJECT:	Schools Maintenance Roofing Works
LEAD OFFICER:	Paul Greenhalgh, Executive Director Children, Families & Learning Jo Negrini, Executive Director of Planning and Environment
CABINET MEMBER:	Councillor Simon Hall Cabinet Member for Finance & Treasury <i>And:</i> Councillor Alisa Flemming, Cabinet Member for Children, Families and Learning
WARDS:	
CORPORATE PRIORITY/POLICY CONTEXT: The delivery of this project is critical in ensuring the Authority is able to meet its statutory obligations to provide sufficient school places to meet increasing demand and will support the Authority in meeting the Policy Objectives of: <ul style="list-style-type: none">◆ Achieving better outcomes for children and young people◆ Promoting economic growth and prosperity	
FINANCIAL IMPACT SUMMARY: This report recommends commitment to a Contract Award as set out in part B of this report from the £4,121,067 budget allocation for schools major maintenance of which £1,525,000 has been set aside for roofing works.	
KEY DECISION REFERENCE NO.: 1297 This is not a Key Decision as defined in the Council's Constitution. The decision may be implemented from 1300 hours on the 5 th working day after it is made, unless the decision is referred to the Scrutiny & Strategic Overview Committee by the requisite number of Councillors.	

Croydon Council

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1.1. The Leader of the Council has delegated to the Cabinet Member for Children, Families & Learning in consultation with Cabinet Member for Finance and Treasury and authority to make the decisions set out in the recommendations below.

The Cabinet Member for Children, Families & Learning , in consultation with the Cabinet Member for Finance and Treasury is recommended to:

- 1.2 Approve the award of JCT Minor Works contracts in the total amount of £810,344 for replacement flat roofing works at each of the following schools:-

- ◆ Monks Orchard Primary School
- ◆ Woodside Primary School
- ◆ Wolsey Infants School
- ◆ Park Hill Infants School
- ◆ Phil Edwards Pupil Referral Unit

to the highest bidder named, and on the terms detailed, in the associated Part B report.

- 1.3 Note that, subject to approval of the above recommendation, the name of the successful contract will be published with the record of this decision

2. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 2.1 This report recommends the award of the flat roof refurbishment works utilising JCT Minor Works contract at the following schools:

- ◆ Monks Orchard Primary School
- ◆ Woodside Primary School
- ◆ Wolsey Infants School
- ◆ Phil Edwards PRU
- ◆ Park Hill Infants School

(“the Works”)

- 2.2 The Detail Section of this report sets out the background to the project, the procurement approach and evaluation process to select the contractor to undertake the Works.

- 2.3 This Work forms part of the Annual Schools Maintenance Plan programme and the capital funding for the Works is part of the overall major maintenance works budget agreed by the Leader of Croydon Council on the 3rd June 2014 (attached Appendix C)

Croydon Council

3. DETAIL

Background:

- 3.1 The Annual Schools Maintenance Plan 2014/15 (the programme) is vital to enable key elements of school buildings to be improved, upgraded and changed. Surveys are carried out throughout the school estate to determine the condition of the buildings and equipment within each school. These survey reports together with officer historical knowledge and work records are used to identify the greatest risk of failure in building element /equipment that could result in a school facility closing and/or causing serious disruption to the operation of the school.
- 3.2 Currently there is an allocated £4.12m budget for the Schools Maintenance Programme for 2014/15. This is sufficient to undertake the highest ranked projects, those categorised as the worst defects in the condition survey report which includes these roof replacement works.

Main Contractor Procurement

- 3.3 Since the value of the Works contract was below the EU threshold for construction works, the tenderers were selected from Constructionline in accordance with the Council's Tender approved protocol. Subject to compliance with the specification and specified completion dates, Price and Quality were the Award Criteria for the contract with a split of 50% Price and 50% Quality.
- 3.4 A restricted competitive tendering process, (compliant with the Council's Tenders and Contracts Regulations), was undertaken. Four suppliers were selected based upon their location, size of business and specialism for roof works and invited to participate in the tender opportunity.
- 3.5 The Invitation to Tender (ITT) documents were issued to the bidders, via the e-tendering portal published on 12th May 2014 with a return deadline date of: 30th May 2014.

4. REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS/PROPOSED DECISION

Tender Evaluation Process

- 4.1 The Evaluation Panel was formed by representatives from the following:-
 - ◆ Procurement Officer (Moderator for the evaluation process);
 - ◆ Project Manager – Croydon Council
 - ◆ Technical Consultant – JTA Consulting
- 4.2 Bid submissions were received from three of the four invited contractors and were reviewed and validated by the project consultants, JTA Ltd, to ensure technical compliance with the specifications. Additionally, the pricing documents were checked for arithmetical errors

Croydon Council

4.4 Following post tender clarifications, the evaluated scores are given in the following table with Bidder B achieving the best price and quality scores.

	Contractor A	Contractor B	Contractor C
Bid Sum	£890,821.17	£810,344.49	£850,240.36
Price Score %	45%	50%	47%
Quality Score %	13%	37%	25%
Total %	58%	87%	73%
Ranking	3rd	1st	2nd

Based on the above scores, it is recommended that the contracts for the Work is awarded to Contractor B recommended as offering the Most Economically Advantageous Tender

4. ANY OPTIONS CONSIDERED AND REJECTED

4.1. As the recommended bidder submitted a compliant bid, achieving an overall combined score of 87%, no other options have been considered.

5. FINANCIAL AND RISK ASSESSEMENT CONSIDERATIONS

5.1.1. Revenue and Capital Consequences of Report Recommendations

As detailed within Part B of this report

5.1.2. Effect of the Decision:

This report recommends commitment to replacing the flat roofs at the schools detailed at 2.1 above using JCT 2011 Minor Works contracts for each school, thereby minimising contract risks such as delays and claims for additional costs. The decision will ensure that the Works are commenced during July and are completed in time for the Autumn 2014 Term.

5.1.3. **Risks:** The works are not completed within the programme timescales. This will be mitigated by making formal site visits and minutes, with interim valuations being carried out at regular intervals. The valuations will be based on works completed at that time to a quality standard acceptable to the project manager, based on British Standards as required in the contract specifications.

Croydon Council

- 5.1.4. All payments to the contractor are made in arrears following monthly valuations to determine the amount of works done. A valuation certificate is then issued to a value determined by the Contract Administrator and then the contractor presents his invoice for payment which may not exceed the certified amount. Following council procedure this invoice is then paid 30 days after the presentation of the invoice.
- 5.1.5. If the work is not completed, the risk of roof failure and school closure would exist
- 5.1.6. **Options:** The content and programme of works have been agreed in consultation with all stakeholders and are considered to be the optimum solution. The recommendation to appoint this contractor follows a competitive tendering exercise and no other options are being considered.
- 5.1.7. **Future Savings / Efficiencies:** Although there are no direct savings or efficiencies from this report, the need for emergency repairs will be mitigated. Furthermore, the chosen materials have a 20 year guarantee thereby protecting the Council's future interests. Following the tendering exercise the contractor recommended for approval is the one considered to offer the Most Economically Advantageous Tender based on the combined price and quality tender scores as in Para 4.4 above.
- 5.1.8. The roof insulation will be replaced as part of the works, achieving improved thermal efficiency and thereby potential energy savings.

Approved by: Dianne Ellender, Head of Finance & Deputy S151 Officer

6. COMMENTS OF THE COUNCIL SOLICITOR

- 6.1. The Council Solicitor comments that the procurement process as detailed in this report meets the requirements of the Council's Tenders and Contracts Regulations and the statutory duty to demonstrate best value under the Local Government Act 1999.

Approved by: Gabriel Macgregor, Head of Corporate Law on behalf of the Council Solicitor & Monitoring Officer

7. HUMAN RESOURCES IMPACT

- 7.1. This report does not directly raise considerations of staffing levels, restructuring/regarding, TUPE implications, recruitment, employee relations, the Council's personnel policies or other Human Resources matter and therefore has not sought approval from Human Resources.

8. EQUALITIES ANALYSIS

Croydon Council

- 8.1 An Initial Equalities Impact Assessment was undertaken and the equality officer considered that the projects would not impact on the various equality groups so that a full assessment is not necessitated.

9. ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

- 9.1. The proposals of the roof Works include the upgrading of the insulation to the roof in line with current building regulations requirements which will reduce the CO₂ emissions of the finished building and which will allow the Council to comply with its statutory obligations .

10. CRIME AND DISORDER REDUCTION IMPACT

- 10.1 There are no immediate Crime and Disorder consequences of this proposal.

11. FREEDOM OF INFORMATION (FoI) / DATA PROTECTION CONSIDERATIONS

- 11.1. There are no specific Data Protection considerations arising from this report.
- 11.2. The Council's Procurement Strategy and Tenders & Contracts Regulations are accessible under the Freedom of Information Act 2000 as part of the Council's Publication Scheme. Information requested under that Act about the specific procurement exercise and contract which are the subject of this report, held internally or supplied by external organisations, will be accessible subject to legal advice as to its commercial confidentiality, or other applicable exemption, and whether or not it is in the public interest to do so.

12. CUSTOMER IMPACT

- 12.1. The successful and timely completion of this project will enable the primary school children to receive their education in an improved environment and the new roofs will be designed to improve their insulation levels improving the amenity of the buildings.

13. HUMAN RIGHTS IMPACT

- 13.1. These works will assist the Council in its compliance with Article 2 of the First Protocol of the European Convention provides a right to an effective education though in the UK this is limited by reservation to the extent that it is necessary and within public spending limits. |

14. CONSULTATION

- 14.1. Formal Consultation is not required for these works as they are part of an annual ongoing maintenance however the schools are informed of and engaged in the programme.

CONTACT OFFICER:

Croydon Council

Name:	John Benjamins
Post title:	Project Manager
Telephone number:	020 8726 6000 ext 50072