

LONDON BOROUGH OF CROYDON

REPORT:	Croydon & Lewisham Street Lighting Joint Committee	
DATE OF DECISION	19 October 2023	
REPORT TITLE:	The Joint Street Lighting PFI Update	
CORPORATE DIRECTOR / DIRECTOR:	Croydon: Corporate Director of Sustainable Communities, Regeneration and Economic Recovery. Lewisham: Executive Director for Place	
LEAD OFFICER:	John Algar: Street Lighting Manager	
LEAD MEMBER:	Croydon: Councillors Scott Roche and Robert Ward Lewisham: Councillors Louise Krupski and Amanda De Ryk	
AUTHORITY TO TAKE DECISION:	N/A: Governance of PFI Contract.	
KEY DECISION? [Insert Ref. Number if a Key Decision]	N/A	
CONTAINS EXEMPT INFORMATION? <i>(* See guidance)</i>	NO	
WARDS AFFECTED:	All	

SUMMARY OF REPORT:

This report advises the Committee of the overall performance of the service provider during September 2022 – August 2023.

COUNCIL PRIORITIES:

Croydon:

Croydon Councils corporate priorities of cleaning up Croydon, addressing planning and town centre regeneration, tackling violent crime, speeding up housing improvements and financial discipline and recovery.

Lewisham

Lewisham Council's corporate priorities of making Lewisham greener and building safer communities.

FINANCIAL IMPACT:

Noting the recommendations in this report will reflect the agreement made by Croydon and Lewisham Council to the sums set out in the P.F.I contract agreement. Each authority has made plans as it considers appropriate for the financial implications of the project. No additional expenditure is proposed because of this report.

1. Recommendations

The Committee is asked to:

- Note the performance of Service Provider in respect of the street lighting PFI for September 2022 - August 2023
- Approve the proposed unitary charges for 2023/4 of £2.834m for Croydon and £1.594m for Lewisham (based on a 64% to 36% split)
- Approve the forecasted contract management and monitoring costs for 2023/4 of £162,000 for Croydon and £101,000 for Lewisham (based on 64% to 36% split).

Actions from last meeting: 13 October 2022

- JA to push Milestone for reduction in costs for LED lantern replacements.

Ongoing discussions have been held with Milestone to seek reduction in installation costs for LED lanterns to become a viable solution for each Authority.

Milestone to present proposal to authority at joint meeting arranged for 28 September 2023.

2.Executive Summary

2.1 This report advises the Committee of the overall performance of the service provider during September 2022 – August 2023.

3.Detail: Operational Performance Standards Overview

3.1 The Output Specification for this contract defines both Councils' requirements for the service that the service provider shall provide pursuant to this contract. The performance standards within the Output Specification specify the required outcome, service delivery, performance requirements and measurement criteria in respect of each part of the service. The performance is reviewed on a monthly basis as part of the "Monthly Monitoring Report" and this is linked directly to any financial adjustments for failing to meet the minimum requirements set out each performance standard.

3.2 The service provider shall perform the service in accordance with the following performance standards:

PS1 – Core Investment Programme.

3.3 The service provider designed and installed new apparatus during the five-year Core Investment Programme (CIP) across both councils to the current British Standards and contract specification. The Core Investment Programme was completed 31 October 2016. The Croydon Public Lighting Network Cable has been de-energised and abandoned by UKPN. The old stumps that were previously keeping the Public Lighting Network Cable functioning have been completely removed.

PS2 - Planned Maintenance, Inspection and Testing.

3.4 This performance standard covers planned maintenance, inspection and testing of street lighting equipment. Routine scouting of all streetlights (including CMS) is undertaken, and the performance is measured over a four-month period. During the period September 2022 – August 2023 the following wards were completed as part of the Annual Programme:

Bulk Clean and Change & Electrical Testing (Columns Y1)

Lewisham: Brockley (800), Lee Green (819), Ladywell (745), Evelyn (1393), Telegraph Hill (888), New Cross Gate (1147), Downham (1038)

Croydon: Heathfield (1464), Purley (1297), Selsdon & Ballards (919),

Total Assets: 10,510 across both boroughs.

Electrical Testing Signs (Signs Y2)

Lewisham: Brockley (218), Lee Green (121), Ladywell (57), Evelyn (176), Telegraph Hill (129), New Cross Gate (101), Downham (159),

Croydon: Heathfield (165), Purley (131), Selsdon & Ballards (23),

Total Assets: 1280 across both boroughs

Signs Clean only (Y2)

Lewisham: Catford South(57), Perry Vale(87), Bellingham(49), Forest Hill(60), Sydenham(38), Blackheath(171), Grove Park(57), Crofton Park(98), Lewisham Central(163), Brockley(218), Rushey Green(104), Lee Green(120), Ladywell(55), Evelyn(182), Telegraph Hill(135), New Cross Gate(98), Downham(212)

Croydon: Ashburton(123), Fieldway(72), New Addington(79), Shirley(84), Broad Green(326), Norbury(72), South Norwood(153), Thornton Heath(150), Upper Norwood(179), Waddon(222), West Thornton(141), Addiscombe(179), Bensham Manor(150), Fairfield(413), Selhurst(210), Woodside(224), Croham(285), Heathfield(166), Purley(134), Selsdon & Ballards(20), Coulsdon East(69), Coulsdon West(235), Kenley(49), Sanderstead(113).

Total Assets: 5,752 across both boroughs

Visual Inspections (Y1)

Lewisham: Lewisham Central (931), Brockley(798), Rushey Green(824), Lee Green(819), Ladywell(745), Evelyn(1379),

Croydon: Addiscombe (681), Bensham Manor(565), Fairfield(1528), Selhurst(885), Woodside(921), Croham(1411), Purley(1297),

Total Assets: 12,784 across both boroughs.

The service provider continues to deliver a good standard of performance within this performance standard. Joint site inspections are carried out between client monitoring team and service provider to verify works have been completed.

Structural Testing: Demmed to Comply Lamp Columns

Lewisham: Catford South (141), Perry Vale(45), Forest Hill(152), Sydenham(47), Blackheath(72), Grove Park(176), Crofton Park(95), Lewisham Central(152), Brockley(129), Rushey Green(342), Lee Green(148), Ladywell(105), Evelyn(223), Telegraph Hill(299), New Cross Gate(256), Downham(349).

Croydon: Fieldway(23), New Addington(78), Broad Green(4), Norbury(56), South Norwood(67), Thornton Heath(8), Waddon(99), West Thornton(45), Bensham Manor(18), Fairfield(92), Selhurst(148), Woodside(151), Heathfield(21), Purley(40), Coulsdon East(6), Coulsdon West(110), Sanderstead(88).

Total Assets: 3,785 across both boroughs.

- 3.5 The table below illustrates the overall performance over the last 12 months for lights in light. The service provider continues to perform at a high standard and has achieved the required level of 99% lights throughout this period, therefore no financial adjustment has occurred within this performance standard.

- 3.9 During this reporting period as detailed in table 2 above, all emergency faults were attended within the 1-hour timeframe apart from January 2023 where operative was late due to wrong operative being called from Milestones call centre. Evidence was provided by service provider of which financial adjustment was waived.
For non – emergency Faults as detailed in table 2 above, all faults were repaired within the 4-day rectification timeframe apart from October 2022, November 2022, January 2023 and July 2023 of which financial adjustments were applied.

PS4 - Contract Management and Customer Interface.

- 3.10 For the service period, the service provider shall provide a customer care and contract management service in accordance with this Performance Standard that includes the development, operation and maintenance of a Management Information System (MIS) and Customer Care System (CCS).
- 3.11 The table below shows telephone calls received by the call centre and emergency phone line during the period September 2022 to August 2023. The performance target is 95% of all calls being answered within 25 seconds of which this target has been achieved.

Sep 2022	Oct 2022	Nov 2022	Dec 2022	Jan 2023	Feb 2023	Mar 2023	Prescribed response period
99	104	98	68	83	83	101	= # calls received by call centre/ emergency phone line
97	104	96	65	82	82	99	= # answered by a trained call agent within 25 seconds
97.8%	100%	97.96%	95.59%	98.80%	98.80	98.02%	= % answered by a trained call agent within 25 seconds

Apr 2023	May 2023	Jun 2023	Jul 2023	Aug 2023			Prescribed response period
99	70	62	74	85			= # calls received by call centre / emergency phone line
99	69	60	73	83			= # answered by a trained call agent within 25 seconds
100%	98.57%	96.77%	98.65%	97.65%			= % answered by a trained call agent within 25 seconds

PS5 - Strategic Assistance and Reporting.

3.12 The service provider shall provide relevant, accurate and timely information to the councils on its performance in relation to the services in Monthly Service Reports and Annual Service Reports to ensure that the strategic assistance and reporting procedures adopted for delivery of the Service:

- (i) enable the Councils to properly monitor the Service and have sufficient data and information to assess accurately what Adjustments, (if any) to the Unitary Charge should be made.
- (ii) allow the Councils to demonstrate that it is achieving its Best Value Duty and continuous improvement in the delivery of the Service; and
- (iii) allow the Councils to regularly review the Service to determine whether it meets current and future needs; consult with users and other stakeholders and benchmark performance against other Service Providers.

Monthly monitoring and Monthly Payment Reports are combined to reduce the administration burden for the councils and are provided by the fifth business day of the month following the month for which the report relates.

For this period all reports were received on time.

PS6 - Working Practices.

3.13 Performance Standard 6 requires the Service Provider to ensure it operates the day-to-day working practices correctly and safely.

During September 2022 – August 2023 there were no serious or urgent service failures.

Routine service failures were identified during this period but for May 2023 financial adjustments were applied as exceeding the 25 permitted points target. These were for permit failures in accordance with Appendix 21 table and PS6 performance target.

Overall, the service provider continues to perform very well with regards to staff Health & Safety issues for its own staff and ensuring site conditions are monitored and kept in a safe condition.

Fortnightly meetings are carried out with the service provider, to resolve any potential issues and collaborate works with both authorities NRSWA teams to minimize any disruption.

Below is the table of any service failures under PS6 Working Practices

Categories of the faults relating to these practices are detailed below:

Fault Type	Definition	September 2022	October 2022	November 2022	December 2022	January 2023	February 2023	March 2023
Urgent service faults	Any Service Failure that: (a) poses a material risk to life; or (b) poses a material risk of damage to person and/or property; or (c) poses a material risk of significant financial loss and/or disruption to the Authority.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Serious service faults	Any Service Failure that is such that it may develop into an Urgent Service Failure if not rectified or attended to in accordance with Good Industry Practice.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Routine service faults	Any Service Failure that is not immediately detrimental or likely to lead to a Serious Service Failure or an Urgent Service Failure, but that, if not rectified or attended to in accordance with Good Industry Practice, may adversely impact on the Service and / or the Authority's reputation and / or the Service Provider's reputation.	0	0	0	10	15	15	0

Fault Type	Definition	April 2023	May 2023	June 2023	July 2023	August 2023
Urgent service faults	Any Service Failure that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) poses a material risk to life; or (b) poses a material risk of damage to person and/or property; or (c) poses a material risk of significant financial loss and/or disruption to the Authority. 	0	0	0	0	0
Serious service faults	Any Service Failure that is such that it may develop into an Urgent Service Failure if not rectified or attended to in accordance with Good Industry Practice.	0	0	0	0	0
Routine service faults	Any Service Failure that is not immediately detrimental or likely to lead to a Serious Service Failure or an Urgent Service Failure, but that, if not rectified or attended to in accordance with Good Industry Practice, may adversely impact on the Service and / or the Authority's reputation and / or the Service Provider's reputation.	0	30	20	0	0

PS7 - Reporting to the Authority.

- 3.14 In order for the Councils to monitor the performance of the service provider and to ensure appropriate monthly payments are made under the contract, the service provider shall provide accurate and complete reporting to the Councils on how the service provider is complying with the requirements of the Output Specification.

Over this period the committee are asked to note all reports were submitted on time.

PS9 - Central Management System.

- 3.15 When this contract was awarded both councils opted for a Central Management System (CMS) to be installed to all streetlights as part of a “mandatory variant solution”. In technical terms the key difference between the mandatory variant solutions and standard Solutions is that the mandatory variant solution enables lights to be dimmed, or brightened, flexibly, whereas in the standard solution lights will only come on and off at fixed ambient light levels. The advantage of the mandatory variant solutions is its flexibility, and the opportunity that it affords to cut energy consumption and therefore costs or otherwise to respond to policy considerations. This is something both boroughs have explored under a Variable Lighting Policy.
- 3.16 Once the Independent Certifier issued the Certificate of Compliance for the new street lighting on a street-by-street basis the Service Provider ensured that all Replacement CIP Apparatus is connected to and operating on the Central Management System.

The client team are continuing to monitor the current operation of the CMS which has resulted in a reduction of failures within the system. Client team officers review the information provided by City Touch so that checks can be carried out to ensure any outages are raised within the M.I.S within the 4-day rectification period.

- 3.17 After the completion of the Core Investment Programme across both boroughs as of August 2023 there are 41,370 street lighting columns connected to the Central Management System (see below). The remaining assets are in subways and car parks that are not connected to the CMS and are scouted separately.

	Croydon	Lewisham	Months Total
Previous Total	25,011	16,298	41,309
Aug-23	59	2	61
Current Total	25,070	16,300	41,370
Total Number of Certified assets connected to CMS	41,370		
Days in Month	31		
Unit/days Comms	1,282,470		
Number of Unreachable units in month	300		
CMS Communicating	99.98%		

- 3.18 Lewisham introduced their variant lighting level policy in November 2016 which received Mayor and Cabinet approval. To date the service provider and the client monitoring team have still not received any specific complaints in relation to the introduction of this policy.
- 3.19 Croydon have now introduced a variant lighting level policy after a successful trial period. To date the service provider and the client monitoring team have still not received any specific complaints in relation to the introduction of this policy.

4. CONSULTATION

- 4.1 During the mobilisation phase and throughout the CIP, the Service Provider was required to liaise and consult with all relevant bodies, which included the Councils, its officers, and all other stakeholders.
- 4.2 There is a mechanism built within the Output Specification to ensure that this consultation process takes place.
- 4.3 As the CIP programme has finished both Authorities have agreed not to consult with residents about any customer satisfaction surveys as they feel the information will not be beneficial.

5 FINANCIAL AND RISK ASSESSMENT CONSIDERATIONS

- 5.1 As per the Co-Operation Agreement the Joint Committee is required to submit final estimates for approval to the Constituent Authorities no later than November 30th. The Joint Committee is then to set its budget no later than March 15th each year. The structure of the Payment Mechanism includes a payment in arrears for the service. Any under performance in a period will be reflected in a payment adjustment in the following period. A draft Monthly Payment Report is provided to the Councils within five business days of the month for which it is reporting no later than the end of the month a final monthly payment report is issued to the authority and the authority has 20 business days to settle the account.
- 5.2 The budget for running the Joint Committee itself is minimal and can be contained within the overall project budget or other existing budgets. The contract budget for the year is as set out in the PFI financial model. This budget includes provision for expenditure on the PFI contract itself, the contract monitoring costs and contributions into the sinking fund to even out PFI liabilities over the life of contract, with LBC acting as the lead authority on payments. The anticipated cost for 2023/24 is expected to be £11.539m. The proposed unitary charge in 2023/24 for Croydon and Lewisham works out at £2.834m and £1.594m respectively (based on agreed 64% to 36% split), with the remaining contribution derived from PFI credits provided by the Department for Transport. Energy costs are paid directly to the respective energy suppliers by the individual authorities and are not part of the sinking fund payment process.
- 5.3 The forecasted contract management and monitoring costs for 2023/24 based on 64% to 36% split are Croydon £162,000, Lewisham £101,000.
- 5.4 The financial model sinking fund is periodically reviewed to ensure that adequate resources are set aside for future liabilities. The contributions for 2023/24 have been adjusted accordingly. These are offset in part by contract performance deductions.
- 5.5 Both Croydon and Lewisham have completed the refinancing of the senior debt related to the Croydon & Lewisham Street lighting PFI.

Approved by: Darrell Jones, Acting Head of Finance (Croydon) 22/09/2023.

Approved by: Shola Ojo, Strategic Finance Business Partner HRPR (Lewisham) 25/09/23.

6. LEGAL CONSIDERATIONS

- 6.1 To align the constituent authorities, the legal teams created two agreements, the Governance Agreement and the Co-operation Agreement.

- 6.2 The Governance Agreement was put in place to set out the joint arrangements for the management of the joint street lighting PFI Project. It details the functions of the Joint Committee, its constitution and decision-making powers.
- 6.3 The Co-operation Agreement sets out the detailed arrangements relating to operation matters including how any disputes between the constituent authorities are to be settled and budget provisions to cover the management costs of the Project.
- 6.4 It is the function of the Joint Committee to monitor the operational performance of the Service Provider and to receive reports from the Management Board consisting of two representatives of each constituent authority as to the Service Provider’s performance over the last quarter.

Approved by: Kiri Bailey, Head of Commercial & Property Law (Croydon) 26/09/2023.

Approved by: Melanie Dawson, Principal Lawyer (Lewisham) 22/09/2023.

7. HUMAN RESOURCES IMPACT

- 7.1 There are no Human Resources considerations arising from this report. If any should arise these will be managed under the Councils Policies and Procedures.

Approved by: Jennifer Sankar, Head of Human Resources (Croydon) for Housing Directorate and SCRER Directorate for and on behalf of Dean Shoosmith, Chief People Officer (Croydon). 21/09/2023.

8. EQUALITIES IMPACT

- 8.1 An updated Equalities Impact Assessment (EIA) has been undertaken, and there are no specific disadvantages associated with replacing the street lighting in the boroughs. Indeed, the enhanced lighting will be of benefits to all residents and businesses.

Lewisham and Croydon have introduced their variable lighting Policies across both boroughs which included an updated EIA.

Both Authorities have their own separated policies which do not need to be linked.

Approved by: Denise McCausland, Equalities Programme Manager (Croydon) 21/09/2023.

9. ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

- 9.1 Carbon emissions from Croydon & Lewisham’s Street lighting are shown in the tables below. While annual consumption has steadily decreased since 2019/20 the total annual CO₂ emissions have decreased by 58% over 6 years. This is due to the rapid decarbonisation of the UK electricity grid that has been achieved by significant growth of renewable energy generation (primarily offshore wind and large-scale solar farms).

Croydon

Year	Consumption kWh	CO ₂ tonne	Grid carbon emission factor (kg CO ₂ kWh)
2022/23	7,028,724	1,468	0.20890
2021/22	8,652,508	1,837	0.21233

2020/21	8,989,281	2,256	0.25091
2019/20	10,450,119	2,875	0.27511
2018/19	11,320,710	3,451	0.30482
2017/18	10,014,298	3,820	0.38146
2016/17	9,860,865	4,404	0.44662

Lewisham

Year	Consumption kWh	CO₂ tonne	Grid carbon emission factor (kg CO₂ kWh)
2022/23	4,292,280	897	0.20890
2021/22	4,233,664	968	0.22876
2020/21	4,126,786	1,035	0.25091
2019/20	4,381,438	1,205	0.27511
2018/19	4,432,250	1,351	0.30482
2017/18	4,900,020	1,869	0.38146
2016/17	6,357,241	2,839	0.44662

- 9.2 The CMS functionality has helped manage the total annual consumption through implementation of both boroughs Variant Lighting Level Policies. Reductions achieved through this has minimised electricity costs and the associated CO₂ emissions. Further consumption reductions would be secured from moving to LED lamps (subject to viability assessment).
- 9.3 Croydon Council has declared a 'Climate Emergency' and has set a target to be carbon neutral by 2030. Croydon does not purchase renewable electricity as certified by 'Renewable Energy Guarantee of Origin' (REGO) certificates. This is because such supplies do not deliver any additional CO₂ savings than a standard electricity contract. The decarbonisation of the grid (as highlighted in the above table) has been achieved by the regulated market subsidy mechanisms. The cost of this is passed on to all electricity users via the fixed charges. Current government policies are to deliver a zero-carbon grid by 2050. Croydon will therefore need to secure additional zero carbon electricity through its contracts to achieve the 2030 target.
- 9.4 Croydon is currently working with other London boroughs to identify the best value options to secure 100% renewable electricity. This is through the 'Renewable Power for London' programme established by London Councils.
- 9.5 Lewisham Council declared a Climate Emergency in 2019 and in 2020 published its Emergency Action Plan setting out actions in support of the ambition for the borough to be net zero by 2030. Achieving that ambition is hugely challenging and will require significant and sustained investment nationally, regionally, and locally. As part of that the Council is looking to demonstrate leadership through decarbonising its own operations, which includes street lighting. Based on the Council's most recent published data on corporate carbon emissions for the full year 2020/21 street lighting equates to just over 10% of the Council's scope 1 and 2 emissions from sources owned and managed by the Council.
- 9.6 In 2017/18 Lewisham Council achieved a reduction of 1,457,221 kWh and consequently a reduction of almost 1,000 tonnes of CO₂ because of a new variable lighting policy through the

CMS functionality. This policy implemented targeted dimming of streetlights, the pushing back of switch-on times and bringing forward of switch-off times for streetlights.

- 9.7 Lewisham Council supports the ongoing assessment of the viability of LED lights which could offer further significant reductions in energy consumption and associated emissions.

Approved by: Bob Fiddik, Team Leader – Sustainable Development & Energy (Croydon) 26/09/2023.

Approved by: Martin O'Brien – Climate Resilience Manager (Lewisham) 22/09/2023.

10. CRIME AND DISORDER REDUCTION IMPACT

- 10.1 The general improvement of the street lighting has as expected had a positive impact in the lower levels of crime and disorder.

11. CUSTOMER IMPACT

- 11.1 The core objective of the street lighting replacement programme, the replacement of the existing aged equipment with a new and well-maintained service, had a positive impact on the residents.
- 11.2 Croydon has introduced their variant lighting level policy and results show there is no impact on residents and stakeholders as no complaints been received.

12. DATA PROTECTION IMPLICATIONS

- 12.1 Will the subject of the report involve the processing of “personal data”?
NO.

Has a Data Protection impact assessment (DPIA) been completed?
Not Required.

CONTACT OFFICERS:

Karen Agbabiaka, Director of Streets and Environment, Croydon Council: **Telephone:** 02087266000 (ext. 52821) **Email:** Karen.Agbabiaka@croydon.gov.uk

Katharine Nidd, Strategic Procurement and Commercial Services Manager, Lewisham Council. **Telephone:** 02083147000, **Email:** Katharine.Nidd@lewisham.gov.uk

John Algar, Street Lighting Manager, Croydon Council
Telephone: 07917555216, **Email:** john.algar@croydon.gov.uk

Appendices to add to this report: None

Background Papers: None